# Open Meeting Law Guide



Commonwealth of Massachusetts

OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL MARTHA COAKLEY

JULY 1, 2010

Dear Massachusetts Residents:

On July 1, 2010, the Attorney General's Office assumed responsibility for the enforcement of the Open Meeting Law (OML) from the state's District Attorneys. We believe that transferring all enforcement to one central statewide office will allow for greater consistency and will ensure that local officials have access to the information they need to comply with the law.

Our office is committed to ensuring that the changes to the Open Meeting Law will provide for greater transparency and clarity – both of which are hallmarks of good government. We are focused on providing educational materials, outreach and training sessions to ensure that all members of the public understand the law.

Whether you are a town clerk or town manager, a member of a public body, or an involved resident, I want to thank you for taking the time to understand the Open Meeting Law. We strive to be a resource to you, and encourage you to contact the Division of Open Government at (617) 963-2540 or visit our website at www.mass.gov/ago/openmeeting for more information.

Cordially,

Martina Coahley

Martha Coakley Massachusetts Attorney General

# Attorney General's Open Meeting Law Guide

#### Overview

#### Purpose of the Law

The purpose of the Open Meeting Law is to ensure transparency in the deliberations on which public policy is based. Because the democratic process depends on the public having knowledge about the considerations underlying governmental action, the Open Meeting Law requires, with some exceptions, that meetings of public bodies be open to the public. It also seeks to balance the public's interest in witnessing the deliberations of public officials with the government's need to manage its operations efficiently.

#### AGO Authority

The Open Meeting Law was revised as part of the 2009 Ethics Reform Bill, and now centralizes responsibility for statewide enforcement of the law in the Attorney General's Office (AGO). G.L. c. 30A, §19 (a). To help public bodies understand and comply with the revised law, the Attorney General has created the Division of Open Government. The Division of Open Government provides training, responds to inquiries, investigates complaints, and when necessary, makes findings and takes remedial action to address violations of the law. The purpose of this Guide is to inform elected and appointed members of public bodies, as well as the interested public, of the basic requirements of the law.

#### Certification

Within two weeks of qualification for office, all members of public bodies must complete the attached Certificate of Receipt of Open Meeting Law Materials certifying that they have received these materials, and that they understand the requirements of the Open Meeting Law and the consequences for violating it. The certification must be retained where the body maintains its official records. All public body members should familiarize themselves with the Open Meeting Law, Attorney General's regulations, and this Guide.

#### **Open Meeting Website**

This Guide is intended to be a clear and concise explanation of the Open Meeting Law's requirements. A more in-depth explanation of the law along with up-to-date regulations, training materials, advisory opinions and orders can be found on the Attorney General's Open Meeting website, <u>http://www.mass.gov/ago/openmeeting</u>.

Local and state government officials, members of public bodies and the public are encouraged to visit the website regularly for updates, as well as to view additional Open Meeting Law materials.

#### What meetings are covered by the Open Meeting Law?

With certain exceptions, all meetings of a public body must be open to the public. A meeting is generally defined as "a deliberation by a public body with respect to any matter within the body's jurisdiction." As explained more fully below, a deliberation is a communication between or among members of a public body.

These four questions will help determine whether a communication constitutes a meeting subject to the law:

- 1) is the communication between members of a **public body**;
- 2) does the communication constitute a **deliberation**;
- 3) does the communication involve a matter within the body's jurisdiction; and
- 4) does the communication fall within an exception listed in the law?

# What constitutes a **public body**?

While there is no comprehensive list of public bodies, any multi-member board, commission, council, authority, committee or subcommittee within the Executive branch of state government, or within any county, district, city, region or town, which has been established to serve a public purpose, is subject to the law. The law includes any multi-member body created to advise or make recommendations to a public body, and also includes the board of any local housing or redevelopment authority, and the governing board or body of any authority established by the Legislature to serve a public purpose. The law excludes the Legislature and its committees, bodies of the judicial branch, and bodies appointed by a constitutional officer for the purpose of advising a constitutional officer.

Boards of selectmen and school committees are certainly subject to the Open Meeting Law, as are subcommittees of public bodies, regardless of whether their role is decision-making or advisory. Neither individual government officials, such as a mayor or police chief, nor members of their staffs, are "public bodies" subject to the law, and so they may meet with one another to discuss public business without needing to comply with Open Meeting Law requirements.

# What constitutes a **deliberation**?

The Open Meeting Law defines deliberation as "an oral or written communication through any medium, including electronic mail, between or among a quorum of a public body on any public business within its jurisdiction." Distributing a meeting agenda,

scheduling or procedural information, or reports or documents that may be discussed at the meeting will not constitute deliberation, so long as the material does not express the opinion of a member of the public body. E-mail exchanges between or among a quorum of members of a public body discussing matters within the body's jurisdiction may constitute deliberation, even where the sender of the email does not ask for a response from the recipients.

To be a deliberation, the communication must involve a quorum of the public body. A quorum is usually a majority of the members of a public body. Thus, a communication among less than a quorum of the members of a public body will not be a deliberation, unless there are multiple communications among the members of the public body that would together be a communication among a quorum of members. Courts have held that the Open Meeting Law applies when members of a public body communicate in a manner that seeks to evade the application of the law. Thus, in some circumstances, communications between two members of a public body, when taken together with other communications, may be a deliberation.

#### What matters are within the jurisdiction of the public body?

The Open Meeting Law applies only to the discussion of any "matter within the body's jurisdiction". The law does not specifically define "jurisdiction." But as a general rule, any matter of public business on which a quorum of the public body may make a decision or recommendation would be considered a matter within the jurisdiction of the public body.

#### What are the exceptions to the definition of a meeting?

There are five exceptions to the definition of a meeting under the Open Meeting Law.

- 1. Members of a public body may conduct an onsite inspection of a project or program; however, they cannot deliberate at such gatherings;
- 2. Members of a public body may attend a conference, training program or event; however, they cannot deliberate at such gatherings;
- **3.** Members of a public body may attend a meeting of another public body provided that they communicate only by open participation; however, they cannot deliberate at such gatherings;
- **4.** Meetings of quasi-judicial boards or commissions held solely to make decisions in an adjudicatory proceeding are not subject to the Open Meeting Law; and,
- 5. Town Meetings are not subject to the Open Meeting Law. See G.L. c. 39, § 9.

#### What are the requirements for filing and posting meeting notices?

Except in cases of emergency, a public body must provide the public with notice of its meeting 48 hours in advance, excluding Saturdays, Sundays and holidays. Notice of emergency

meetings must be posted as soon as reasonably possible prior to the meeting. Notices must be posted in a manner that is accessible to disabled persons to the extent required by federal and state law.

- For local public bodies, meeting notices must be filed and available to the public in the office of the municipal clerk. Notices may be posted on a bulletin board, in a loose-leaf binder or on any electronic display (e.g. television, computer monitor, or an electronic bulletin board), provided that the notice is conspicuously visible to the public at all hours in or on the municipal building in which the clerk's office is located. In the event that the meeting notices posted in the municipal building are not visible to the public at all hours, then the municipality must either post notices on the outside of the building or follow one of the alternative posting methods approved by the Attorney General.
- For regional or district public bodies and regional school districts, meeting notices must be filed and posted in the same manner required of local public bodies, in each of the communities within the region or district.
- County public bodies must file meeting notices in the office of the county commissioners and post notice of the meeting in a manner conspicuously visible to the public at all hours at a place or places designated by the county commissioners for notice postings.
- State public bodies must file meeting notices by posting the notice on a website in accordance with procedures that can be found on the Attorney General's Open Meeting Website, <a href="http://www.mass.gov/ago/openmeeting">www.mass.gov/ago/openmeeting</a>.

# Alternate Posting Methods for Local Public Bodies

For local public bodies, the Attorney General has determined that the following alternative methods will provide more effective notice to the public, provided that all meeting notices posted under an alternative method shall include the same content as required by section 29.03(1)(b) and shall also be available during hours when the clerk's office is open in the manner required by subsection 29.03(2)(a):

- (1) public bodies may post notice of meetings on the municipal website, <u>AND</u>, post notice or provide Internet access in an alternate municipal building (e.g., police or fire station) where the notice is accessible at all hours;
- (2) public bodies may post notice of meetings on cable television, <u>AND</u>, post notice or provide cable television access in an alternate municipal building (e.g., police or fire station) where the notice is accessible at all hours;
- (3) public bodies may post notice of meetings in a newspaper of general circulation in the municipality, <u>AND</u>, post notice or a copy of the newspaper containing the meeting notice at an alternate municipal building (e.g., police or fire station) where the notice is accessible at all hours;

- (4) public bodies may place a computer monitor or electronic or physical bulletin board displaying meeting notices on or in a door, window, or near the entrance of the municipal building in which the clerk's office is located in such a manner as to be visible to the public from outside the building, or;
- (5) public bodies may provide an audio recording of meeting notices, available to the public by telephone at all hours.

The clerk of the municipality must inform the AGO of its notice posting method, and update the Division of any future change. All public bodies shall consistently use the most current notice posting method on file with the AGO.

#### What information must meeting notices contain?

Meeting notices must be posted in a legible, easily understandable format; contain the date, time and place of the meeting; and list the topics that, as of the time the notice is filed, the chair reasonably anticipates will be discussed at the meeting. The list of topics must be sufficiently specific to reasonably inform the public of the issues to be discussed at the meeting. While not required under the Open Meeting Law, public bodies are encouraged to make a revised list of topics to be discussed available to the public in advance of the meeting if the body intends to discuss topics that come up within the 48 hour period before the meeting.

#### When can a public body meet in executive session?

While all meetings of public bodies must be open to the public, certain topics may be discussed in executive, or closed, session. Before going into an executive session, the chair of the public body must:

- First convene in open session.
- State the reason for the executive session, stating all subjects that may be revealed without compromising the purpose for which the executive session was called.
- State whether the public body will reconvene at the end of the executive session.
- Take a roll call vote of the body to enter executive session.

While in executive session, the public body must keep accurate records and must take a roll call vote of all votes taken and may only discuss matters for which the executive session was called.

#### The Ten Purposes for Executive Session

The law defines ten specific Purposes for which an executive session may be held, and emphasizes that these are the only purposes for which a public body may enter executive session.

The ten Purposes for which a public body may vote to hold an executive session are:

 To discuss the reputation, character, physical condition or mental health, rather than professional competence, of an individual, or to discuss the discipline or dismissal of, or complaints or charges brought against, a public officer, employee, staff member or individual. The individual to be discussed in such executive session shall be notified in writing by the public body at least 48 hours prior to the proposed executive session; provided, however, that notification may be waived upon written agreement of the parties.

This Purpose is designed to protect the rights and reputation of individuals. Nevertheless, it appears at least that where a public body is discussing an employee evaluation, considering applicants for a position, or discussing the qualifications of any individual, these discussions should be held in open session to the extent that that the discussion deals with issues other than the reputation, character, health, or any complaints or charges against the individual. An executive session called for this Purpose triggers certain rights on the part of an individual who is the subject of the discussion. The individual's right to choose to have his or her dismissal considered at an open meeting takes precedence over the general right of the public body to go into executive session.

While the proposed imposition of disciplinary sanctions by a public body on an individual fits within this Purpose, this Purpose does not apply if, for example, the public body is deciding whether to lay off a large number of employees because of budgetary constraints.

2. To conduct strategy sessions in preparation for negotiations with nonunion personnel or to conduct collective bargaining sessions or contract negotiations with nonunion personnel;

**Collective Bargaining Sessions:** These include not only the bargaining sessions but also include grievance hearings that are called for under a collective bargaining agreement.

3. To discuss strategy with respect to collective bargaining or litigation if an open meeting may have a detrimental effect on the bargaining or litigating position of the public body and the chair so declares;

**Collective Bargaining Strategy:** Discussions with respect to collective bargaining strategy include discussions of proposals for wage and benefit packages or working

conditions for union employees. The public body, if challenged, carries the burden of proving that an open meeting might have a detrimental effect on its bargaining position to justify an executive session on the basis of this Purpose. The showing that must be made is that the open discussion may have a detrimental impact on the collective bargaining process; the body is not required to demonstrate or specify a definite harm that would have arisen. At the time that the executive session is proposed and voted on, the chair must state on the record that having the discussion in an open session may be detrimental to the public body's bargaining or litigating position.

Litigation Strategy: Discussions concerning strategy with respect to ongoing litigation obviously fit within this Purpose, but only if an open meeting may have a detrimental effect on the litigating position of the public body. Discussions relating to potential litigation are not covered by this exemption unless that litigation is clearly and imminently threatened or otherwise demonstrably likely. That a person is represented by counsel and supports a position adverse to the public body's does not by itself mean that litigation is imminently threatened or likely. Nor does the fact that a newspaper reports a party has threatened to sue necessarily mean imminent litigation.

**Note:** A public body's discussions with its counsel do not automatically fall under this or any other Purpose for holding an executive session.

- 4. To discuss the deployment of security personnel or devices, or strategies with respect thereto;
- 5. To investigate charges of criminal misconduct or to consider the filing of criminal complaints;

This Purpose permits an executive session to investigate charges of <u>criminal</u> misconduct and to consider the filing of <u>criminal</u> complaints. Thus it primarily involves discussions that would precede the formal criminal process in court. Purpose 1 is related, in that it permits an executive session to discuss certain complaints or charges, which may include criminal complaints or charges, but only those that have already been brought. Also, unlike Purpose 5, Purpose 1 confers certain rights of participation on the individual involved, as well as the right for the individual to insist that the discussion occur in open session. To the limited extent that there is overlap between Purposes 1 and 5, a public body has discretion to choose which Purpose to invoke when going into executive session.

6. To consider the purchase, exchange, lease or value of real property if the chair declares that an open meeting may have a detrimental effect on the negotiating position of the public body;

Under this Purpose, as with the collective bargaining and litigation Purpose, an executive session may only be held where an open meeting may have a detrimental impact on the body's negotiating position with a third party. At the time that the executive session is proposed and voted on, the chair must state on the record that having the discussion in an open session may be detrimental to the public body's negotiating position.

# 7. To comply with, or act under the authority of, any general or special law or federal grant-in-aid requirements;

There may be provisions in certain statutes or federal grants which require or specifically allow that a public body consider a particular issue in a closed session. Additionally, as the following section discusses, where Purpose (8) does not apply, Purpose (7) may nevertheless apply to the initial stage of a hiring process.

8. To consider or interview applicants for employment or appointment by a preliminary screening committee if the chair declares that an open meeting will have a detrimental effect in obtaining qualified applicants; provided, however, that this clause shall not apply to any meeting, including meetings of a preliminary screening committee, to consider and interview applicants who have passed a prior preliminary screening;

This Purpose permits a hiring subcommittee of a public body or a preliminary screening committee to conduct the initial screening process in executive session. This Purpose does not apply to any stage in the hiring process after the screening committee or subcommittee votes to recommend a candidate or candidates to its parent body. At the time that the executive session is proposed and voted on, the chair must state on the record that having the discussion in an open session will be detrimental to the public body's ability to attract qualified applicants for the position.

9. To meet or confer with a mediator, as defined in section 23C of chapter 233, with respect to any litigation or decision on any public business within its jurisdiction involving another party, group or entity, provided that:

(i) any decision to participate in mediation shall be made in an open session and the parties, issues involved and purpose of the mediation shall be disclosed; and

(ii) no action shall be taken by any public body with respect to those issues which are the subject of the mediation without deliberation and approval for such action at an open session

- **10.** To discuss trade secrets or confidential, competitively-sensitive or other proprietary information provided:
  - a. in the course of activities conducted by a governmental body as an energy supplier under a license granted by the department of public utilities pursuant to G.L. c. 164 § 1F,
  - b. in the course of activities conducted as a municipal aggregator under G.L. c. 164 § 134, or
  - c. in the course of activities conducted by a cooperative consisting of governmental entities organized pursuant to G.L. c. 164 § 136,
  - d. when such governmental body, municipal aggregator or cooperative determines that such disclosure will adversely affect its ability to conduct business in relation to other entities making, selling or distributing electric power and energy

# May a member of the public body participate remotely?

The Attorney General is authorized under the Open Meeting Law to permit remote participation by members of a public body not present at the meeting location. This issue is under consideration by the AGO, which will be seeking public comment. While the issue is under consideration, remote participation by members of public bodies is not permitted under the Open Meeting Law.

#### What public participation in meetings must be allowed?

Under the Open Meeting Law, the public is permitted to attend meetings of public bodies but is excluded from an executive session that is called for a valid purpose listed in the law. Any member of the public also has a right to make an audio or video recording of an open session of a public meeting. A member of the public who wishes to record a meeting must first notify the chair and must comply with reasonable requirements regarding audio or video equipment established by the chair so as not to interfere with the meeting. The chair is required to inform other attendees of such recording at the beginning of the meeting.

While the public is permitted to attend an open meeting, an individual may not address the public body without permission of the chair. An individual is not permitted to disrupt a meeting of a public body, and at the request of the chair, all members of the public shall be silent. If after clear warning, a person continues to be disruptive, the chair may order the person to leave the meeting, and if the person does not leave, the chair may authorize a constable or other officer to remove the person.

Public bodies are required to create and maintain accurate minutes of all meetings, including executive sessions. The minutes, which must be created and approved in a timely manner, must state the date, time and place of the meeting, a list of the members present or absent, and the decisions made and actions taken including a record of all votes. While the minutes must also include a summary of the discussions on each subject, a transcript is not required. No vote taken by a public body, either in an open or in an executive session, shall be by secret ballot. All votes taken in executive session must be by roll call and the results recorded in the minutes. In addition, the minutes must include a list of the documents and other exhibits used at the meeting. While public bodies are required to retain these records in accordance with records retention laws, the documents and exhibits listed in the minutes need not be physically stored with the minutes.

The minutes, documents and exhibits are public records and a part of the official record of the meeting. Whether records are subject to disclosure under the Open Meeting Law will depend on whether the records are from an open session or an executive session.

# **Open Session Meeting Records**

The Open Meeting Law requires public bodies to create and approve minutes in a timely manner. The law requires that existing minutes be made available to the public within 10 days upon request, whether they have been approved or remain in draft form. Materials or other exhibits used by the public body in an open meeting are also to be made available to the public within 10 days upon request.

There are two exemptions to the open session records disclosure requirement that pertain to: 1) materials (other than those that were created by members of the public body for the purpose of the evaluation) used in a performance evaluation of an individual bearing on his professional competence, and 2) materials (other than any resume submitted by an applicant which is always subject to disclosure) used in deliberations about employment or appointment of individuals, including applications and supporting materials.

# **Executive Session Meeting Records**

Public bodies are not required to disclose the minutes, notes or other materials used in an executive session where the disclosure of these records may defeat the lawful purposes of the executive session. Once disclosure would no longer defeat the purposes of the executive session, minutes and other records from that executive session must be disclosed unless they are within an exemption to the Public Records Law, G.L. c. 4, § 7, cl. 26, or are attorney-client privileged. The public body is also required to periodically review the executive session minutes to determine whether continued non-disclosure is warranted, and such determination must be included in the subsequent meeting minutes. A public body must respond to a request to inspect or copy executive session minutes within 10 days of request and promptly release the records if they are subject to disclosure. If the body has not performed a review to determine

whether they are subject to disclosure, it must do so prior to its next meeting or within 30 days, whichever is sooner.

# What is the Attorney General's role in enforcing the Open Meeting Law?

The Attorney General's Division of Open Government is responsible for enforcing the Open Meeting Law. The Attorney General has the authority to take and investigate complaints, bring enforcement actions, issue advisory opinions and issue regulations.

The Division of Open Government regularly seeks feedback from the public on ways in which it can better support public bodies to help them comply with the law's requirements, and will provide online and in-person trainings on the Open Meeting Law. The Division of Open Government will also respond to information requests from public bodies and the public.

The Division of Open Government will take complaints from members of the public and will work with public bodies to resolve problems. While any member of the public may file a complaint with a public body alleging a violation of the Open Meeting Law, a public body need not, and the Division of Open Government will not, investigate anonymous complaints.

# What is the Open Meeting Law complaint procedure?

# Step 1: Filing a Complaint with the Public Body

A complaint must be filed in writing with a public body within 30 days of the date the alleged violation, or if the alleged Open Meeting Law violation could not reasonably have been known at the time it occurred, then within 30 days of the date it should reasonably have been discovered. The complaint must be filed using the Open Meeting Law complaint form available on the Attorney General's website. Public bodies, or in the case of local public bodies the municipal clerk, should provide members of the public with a copy of the complaint form upon request.

# Step 2: Public Body's Response

Within 14 business days of the date on which the complaint was filed, the public body must review the complaint and send to the AGO a copy of the complaint along with a description of any action taken to resolve the issue that was raised by the complaint. Within seven business days of the date that the complaint was filed, the public body may request additional information from the person making the complaint if necessary to resolve the complaint. The person making the complaint shall provide the additional information to the public body within 10 business days, and the public body shall have shall have 10 additional business days (total 24 business days from the date complaint was originally filed) to act on the complaint and notify the AGO. The public body may request additional time to consider taking remedial action and must make that request in writing to the AGO, to the Attention of the

Director of the Division of Open Government. The AGO may, at its discretion, grant additional time to the public body if it determines there is a showing of good cause to grant the extension.

#### Step 3: Filing a Complaint with the Attorney General

If the person who brought the complaint is not satisfied with the action taken by the public body, that person may file a copy of the complaint, along with any other materials the person making the complaint believes are relevant, with the AGO. The AGO may decline to investigate complaints that are filed with the Attorney General more than 90 days after the alleged Open Meeting Law violation, unless an extension was granted to the public body or the person making the complaint demonstrates good cause for the delay.

#### Step 4: Attorney General's Investigation

After reviewing a complaint and supporting materials, the AGO will determine whether there is reasonable cause to believe that the Open Meeting Law has been violated, and if so, whether to conduct a formal investigation. The AGO may request additional information from the person making the complaint. In the event that the AGO opens a formal investigation, the public body shall provide the Attorney General with such information and documents as may be requested. The AGO has the authority compel the production of documents, take oral testimony, and convene a hearing as may be necessary. The AGO will resolve complaints within a reasonable period of time, generally 90 days.

# Step 5: Attorney General's Findings

The AGO will make findings, and where a violation has occurred, may order remedial action. If the AGO determines, after investigation, that the Open Meeting Law has been violated unintentionally, then the AGO will resolve the investigation by informal action or by formal ruling for more significant violations. The AGO may order remedial action by the public body directing immediate and future compliance with the law, attendance at a training session, release of records, or other appropriate action.

Where the AGO seeks to reinstate an employee or nullify the action of a public body as a remedy for the violation, the AGO will ordinarily convene a hearing to take testimony from witnesses to determine the appropriate remedy. If the AGO has reasonable cause to believe that the Open Meeting Law has been violated intentionally, the AGO may convene a hearing to determine whether the violation was intentional, whether the public body, one or more of its members, or both, were responsible, and whether to impose on the public body a civil penalty of up to \$1,000 for each violation.

Public bodies and members of the public should consult the Attorney General's <u>Open</u> <u>Meeting Website</u> for the most up-to-date procedural regulations and other materials related to the law.

# Will the Attorney General's Office provide training on the Open Meeting Law?

The Open Meeting Law directs the AGO to create educational materials and provide training to public bodies to foster awareness of and compliance with the Open Meeting Law. The AGO has established an Open Meeting Law website, <u>www.mass.gov/ago/openmeeting</u>, on which government officials and members of public bodies can find the statute, regulations, opinions, training materials and a schedule of in-person and online training. The AGO will provide regional trainings for members of public bodies and will hold periodic online webinars. For those who cannot attend live training sessions, the Attorney General's website will provide training materials and answers to frequently asked questions.

# **Contacting the Attorney General**

If you have any questions about the Open Meeting Law or anything contained in this guide, please contact the Division of Open Government at the Attorney General's Office. The AGO also welcomes any comments, feedback, or suggestions you may have about the Open Meeting Law or this guide.

Division of Open Government Office of the Attorney General 617-963-2540 www.mass.gov/ago/openmeeting <u>OpenMeeting@state.ma.us</u> One Ashburton Place Boston, MA 02108

#### THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

OPEN MEETING LAW, G.L. c. 30A, §§18-25

\* \* \*

Chapter 28 of the Acts of 2009, sections 17–20, repealed the existing state Open Meeting Law, G.L. c. 30A, §§ 11A, 11A-1/2, county Open Meeting Law, G.L. c. 34, §§9F, 9G, and municipal Open Meeting Law, G.L. c. 39, §§ 23A, 23B, and 23C, and replaced them with a single Open Meeting Law covering all public bodies, G.L. c. 30A, §§ 18-25, enforced by the Attorney General.

\* \* \*

#### SECTION 18: [DEFINITIONS]

As used in this section and sections 19 to 25, inclusive, the following words shall, unless the context clearly requires otherwise, have the following meanings:

"Deliberation", an oral or written communication through any medium, including electronic mail, between or among a quorum of a public body on any public business within its jurisdiction; provided, however, that "deliberation" shall not include the distribution of a meeting agenda, scheduling information or distribution of other procedural meeting or the distribution of reports or documents that may be discussed at a meeting, provided that no opinion of a member is expressed.

"Emergency", a sudden, generally unexpected occurrence or set of circumstances demanding immediate action.

"Executive session", any part of a meeting of a public body closed to the public for deliberation of certain matters.

"Intentional violation", an act or omission by a public body or a member thereof, in knowing by violating the open meeting law.

"Meeting", a deliberation by a public body with respect to any matter within the body's jurisdiction; provided, however, "meeting" shall not include:

(a) an on-site inspection of a project or program, so long as the members do not deliberate;

(b) attendance by a quorum of a public body at a public or private gathering, including a conference or training program or a media, social or other event, so long as the members do not deliberate;

(c) attendance by a quorum of a public body at a meeting of another public body that has complied with the notice requirements of the open meeting law, so long as the visiting members communicate only by open participation in the meeting on those matters under discussion by the host body and do not deliberate;

(d) a meeting of a quasi--judicial board or commission held for the sole purpose of making a decision required in an adjudicatory proceeding brought before it; or

(e) a session of a town meeting convened under section 10 of chapter 39 which would include the attendance by a quorum of a public body at any such session.

"Minutes", the written report of a meeting created by a public body required by subsection (a) of section 23 and section 5A of chapter 66.

"Open meeting law", sections 18 to 25, inclusive.

"Post notice", to display conspicuously the written announcement of a meeting either in hard copy or electronic format.

"Preliminary screening", the initial stage of screening applicants conducted by a committee or subcommittee of a public body solely for the purpose of providing to the public body a list of those applicants qualified for further consideration or interview.

"Public body", a multiple-member board, commission, committee or subcommittee within the executive or legislative branch or within any county, district, city, region or town, however created, elected, appointed or otherwise constituted, established to serve a public purpose; provided, however, that the governing board of a local housing, redevelopment or other similar authority shall be deemed a

local public body; provided, further, that the governing board or body of any other authority established by the general court to serve a public purpose in the commonwealth or any part thereof shall be deemed a state public body; provided, further, that "public body" shall not include the general court or the committees or recess commissions thereof, bodies of the judicial branch or bodies appointed by a constitutional officer solely for the purpose of advising a constitutional officer and shall not include the board of bank incorporation or the policyholders protective board; and provided further, that a subcommittee shall include any multiple-member body created to advise or make recommendations to a public body.

"Quorum", a simple majority of the members of the public body, unless otherwise provided in a general or special law, executive order or other authorizing provision.

#### SECTION 19. [DIVISION OF OPEN GOVERNMENT AND ADVISORY COMMISSION]

(a) There shall be in the department of the attorney general a division of open government under the direction of a director of open government. The attorney general shall designate an assistant attorney general as the director of the open government division. The director may appoint and remove, subject to the approval of the attorney general, such expert, clerical and other assistants as the work of the division may require. The division shall perform the duties imposed upon the attorney general by the open meeting law, which may include participating, appearing and intervening in any administrative and judicial proceedings pertaining to the enforcement of the open meeting law. For the purpose of such participation, appearance, intervention and training authorized by this chapter the attorney general may expend such funds as may be appropriated therefor.

(b) The attorney general shall create and distribute educational materials and provide training to public bodies in order to foster awareness and compliance with the open meeting law. Open meeting law training may include, but shall not be limited to, instruction in:

(1) the general background of the legal requirements for the open meeting law;

(2) applicability of sections 18 to 25, inclusive, to governmental bodies;

(3) the role of the attorney general in enforcing the open meeting law; and

(4) penalties and other consequences for failure to comply with this chapter.

(c) There shall be an open meeting law advisory commission. The commission shall consist of 5 members, 2 of whom shall be the chairmen of the joint committee on state administration and regulatory oversight; 1 of whom shall be the president of the Massachusetts Municipal Association or his designee; 1 of whom shall be the president of the Massachusetts Newspaper Publishers Association or his designee; and 1 of whom shall be the attorney general or his designee.

The commission shall review issues relative to the open meeting law and shall submit to the attorney general recommendations for changes to the regulations, trainings, and educational initiatives relative to the open meeting law as it deems necessary and appropriate.

(d) The attorney general shall, not later than January 31, file annually with the commission a report providing information on the enforcement of the open meeting law during the preceding calendar year. The report shall include, but not be limited to:

(1) the number of open meeting law complaints received by the attorney general;

(2) the number of hearings convened as the result of open meeting law complaints by the attorney general;

(3) a summary of the determinations of violations made by the attorney general;

(4) a summary of the orders issued as the result of the determination of an open meeting law violation by the attorney general;

(5) an accounting of the fines obtained by the attorney general as the result of open meeting law enforcement actions;

(6) the number of actions filed in superior court seeking relief from an order of the attorney general; and

(7) any additional information relevant to the administration and enforcement of the open meeting law that the attorney general deems appropriate.

#### SECTION 20. [NOTICE, REMOTE PARTICIPATION, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION, CERTIFICATION]

(a) Except as provided in section 21, all meetings of a public body shall be open to the public.

(b) Except in an emergency, in addition to any notice otherwise required by law, a public body shall post notice of every meeting at least 48 hours prior to such meeting, excluding Saturdays, Sundays and legal holidays. In an emergency, a public body shall post notice as soon as reasonably possible prior to such meeting. Notice shall be printed in a legible, easily understandable format and shall contain the date, time and place of such meeting and a listing of topics that the chair reasonably anticipates will be discussed at the meeting.

(c) For meetings of a local public body, notice shall be filed with the municipal clerk and posted in a manner conspicuously visible to the public at all hours in or on the municipal building in which the clerk's office is located.

For meetings of a regional or district public body, notice shall be filed and posted in each city or town within the region or district in the manner prescribed for local public bodies. For meetings of a regional school district, the secretary of the regional school district committee shall be considered to be its clerk and shall file notice with the clerk of each city or town within such district and shall post the notice in the manner prescribed for local public bodies. For meetings of a county public body, notice shall be filed in the office of the county commissioners and a copy of the notice shall be publicly posted in a manner conspicuously visible to the public at all hours in such place or places as the county commissioners shall designate for the purpose.

For meetings of a state public body, notice shall be filed with the attorney general and a duplicate copy of said notice shall be filed with the regulations division of the state secretary's office by posting on a website in accordance with procedures established for this purpose.

The attorney general shall have the authority to prescribe or approve alternative methods of notice where the attorney general determines such alternative will afford more effective notice to the public.

(d) The attorney general may by regulation or letter ruling, authorize remote participation by members of a public body not present at the meeting location; provided, however, that the absent members and all persons present at the meeting location are clearly audible to each other; and provided, further, that a quorum of the body, including the chair, are present at the meeting location. Such authorized members may vote and shall not be deemed absent for the purposes of section 23D of chapter 39.

(e) After notifying the chair of the public body, any person may make a video or audio recording of an open session of a meeting of a public body, or may transmit the meeting through any medium, subject to reasonable requirements of the chair as to the number, placement and operation of equipment used so as not to interfere with the conduct of the meeting. At the beginning of the meeting the chair shall inform other attendees of any such recordings.

(f) No person shall address a meeting of a public body without permission of the chair, and all persons shall, at the request of the chair, be silent. No person shall disrupt the proceedings of a meeting of a public body. If, after clear warning from the chair, a person continues to disrupt the proceedings, the chair may order the person to withdraw from the meeting and if the person does not withdraw, the chair may authorize a constable or other officer to remove the person from the meeting.

(g) Within 2 weeks of qualification for office, all persons serving on a public body shall certify, on a form prescribed by the attorney general, the receipt of a copy of the open meeting law, regulations promulgated pursuant to section 25 and a copy of the educational materials prepared by the attorney general explaining the open meeting law and its application pursuant to section 19. Unless otherwise directed or approved by the attorney general, the appointing authority, city or town clerk or the executive director or other appropriate administrator of a state or regional body, or their designees, shall obtain such certification from each person upon entering service and shall retain it subject to the applicable records retention schedule where the body maintains its official records. The certification shall be evidence that the member of a public body has read and understands the requirements of the open meeting law and the consequences of violating it.

#### SECTION 21. [EXECUTIVE SESSIONS]

(a) A public body may meet in executive session only for the following purposes:

(1) To discuss the reputation, character, physical condition or mental health, rather than professional competence, of an individual, or to discuss the discipline or dismissal of, or complaints or charges brought against, a public officer, employee, staff member or individual. The individual to be discussed in such executive session shall be notified in writing by the public body at least 48 hours prior to the proposed executive session; provided, however, that notification may be waived upon written agreement of the parties. A public body shall hold an open session if the individual involved requests that the session be open. If an executive session is held, such individual shall have the following rights:

i. to be present at such executive session during deliberations which involve that individual;

ii. to have counsel or a representative of his own choosing present and attending for the purpose of advising the individual and not for the purpose of active participation in the executive session;

iii. to speak on his own behalf; and

iv. to cause an independent record to be created of said executive session by audio-recording or transcription, at the individual's expense.

The rights of an individual set forth in this paragraph are in addition to the rights that he may have from any other source, including, but not limited to, rights under any laws or collective bargaining agreements and the exercise or non-exercise of the individual rights under this section shall not be construed as a waiver of any rights of the individual.

2. To conduct strategy sessions in preparation for negotiations with nonunion personnel or to conduct collective bargaining sessions or contract negotiations with nonunion personnel;

3. To discuss strategy with respect to collective bargaining or litigation if an open meeting may have a detrimental effect on the bargaining or litigating position of the public body and the chair so declares;

4. To discuss the deployment of security personnel or devices, or strategies with respect thereto;

5. To investigate charges of criminal misconduct or to consider the filing of criminal complaints;

6. To consider the purchase, exchange, lease or value of real property if the chair declares that an open meeting may have a detrimental effect on the negotiating position of the public body;

7. To comply with, or act under the authority of, any general or special law or federal grant-in-aid requirements;

8. To consider or interview applicants for employment or appointment by a preliminary screening committee if the chair declares that an open meeting will have a detrimental effect in obtaining qualified applicants; provided, however, that this clause shall not apply to any meeting, including meetings of a preliminary screening committee, to consider and interview applicants who have passed a prior preliminary screening;

9. To meet or confer with a mediator, as defined in section 23C of chapter 233, with respect to any litigation or decision on any public business within its jurisdiction involving another party, group or entity, provided that:

(i) any decision to participate in mediation shall be made in an open session and the parties, issues involved and purpose of the mediation shall be disclosed; and

(ii) no action shall be taken by any public body with respect to those issues which are the subject of the mediation without deliberation and approval for such action at an open session; or

10. to discuss trade secrets or confidential, competitively-sensitive or other proprietary information provided in the course of activities conducted by a governmental body as an energy supplier under a license granted by the department of public utilities pursuant to section 1F of chapter 164, in the course of activities conducted as a municipal aggregator under section 134 of said chapter 164 or in the course of activities conducted by a cooperative consisting of governmental entities organized pursuant to section 136 of said chapter 164, when such governmental body, municipal aggregator or cooperative determines that such disclosure will adversely affect its ability to conduct business in relation to other entities making, selling or distributing electric power and energy.

(b) A public body may meet in closed session for 1 or more of the purposes enumerated in subsection (a) provided that:

1. the body has first convened in an open session pursuant to section 21;

2. a majority of members of the body have voted to go into executive session and the vote of each member is recorded by roll call and entered into the minutes;

3. before the executive session, the chair shall state the purpose for the executive session, stating all subjects that may be revealed without compromising the purpose for which the executive session was called;

4. the chair shall publicly announce whether the open session will reconvene at the conclusion of the executive session; and

5. accurate records of the executive session shall be maintained pursuant to section 23.

#### SECTION 22. [MINUTES, RECORDS]

(a) A public body shall create and maintain accurate minutes of all meetings, including executive sessions, setting forth the date, time and place, the members present or absent, a summary of the discussions on each subject, a list of documents and other exhibits used at the meeting, the decisions made and the actions taken at each meeting, including the record of all votes.

(b) No vote taken at an open session shall be by secret ballot. Any vote taken at an executive session shall be recorded by roll call and entered into the minutes.

(c) Minutes of all open sessions shall be created and approved in a timely manner. The minutes of an open session, if they exist and whether approved or in draft form, shall be made available upon request by any person within 10 days.

(d) Documents and other exhibits, such as photographs, recordings or maps, used by the body at an open or executive session shall, along with the minutes, be part of the official record of the session.

(e) The minutes of any open session, the notes, recordings or other materials used in the preparation of such minutes and all documents and exhibits used at the session, shall be public records in their entirety and not exempt from disclosure pursuant to any of the exemptions under clause Twenty-sixth of section 7 of chapter 4. Notwithstanding this paragraph, the following materials shall be exempt from disclosure to the public as personnel information: (1) materials used in a performance evaluation of an individual bearing on his professional competence, provided they were not created by the members of the body for the purposes of the evaluation; and (2) materials used in deliberations about employment or appointment of individuals, including applications and supporting materials; provided, however, that any resume submitted by an applicant shall not be exempt.

(f) The minutes of any executive session, the notes, recordings or other materials used in the preparation of such minutes and all documents and exhibits used at the session, may be withheld from disclosure to the public in their entirety under subclause (a) of clause Twenty-sixth of section 7 of chapter 4, as long as publication may defeat the lawful purposes of the executive session, but no longer; provided, however, that the executive session was held in compliance with section 21.

When the purpose for which a valid executive session was held has been served, the minutes, preparatory materials and documents and exhibits of the session shall be disclosed unless the attorneyclient privilege or 1 or more of the exemptions under said clause Twenty-sixth of said section 7 of said chapter 4 apply to withhold these records, or any portion thereof, from disclosure.

For purposes of this subsection, if an executive session is held pursuant to clause (2) or (3) of subsections (a) of section 21, then the minutes, preparatory materials and documents and exhibits used at the session may be withheld from disclosure to the public in their entirety, unless and until such time as a litigating, negotiating or bargaining position is no longer jeopardized by such disclosure, at which time they shall be disclosed unless the attorney-client privilege or 1 or more of the exemptions under said clause Twenty-sixth of said section 7 of said chapter 4 apply to withhold these records, or any portion thereof, from disclosure.

(g)(1) The public body, or its chair or designee, shall, at reasonable intervals, review the minutes of executive sessions to determine if the provisions of this subsection warrant continued non-disclosure.

Such determination shall be announced at the body's next meeting and such announcement shall be included in the minutes of that meeting.

(2) Upon request by any person to inspect or copy the minutes of an executive session or any portion thereof, the body shall respond to the request within 10 days following receipt and shall release any such minutes not covered by an exemption under subsection (f); provided, however, that if the body has not performed a review pursuant to paragraph (1), the public body shall perform the review and release the non-exempt minutes, or any portion thereof, not later than the body's next meeting or 30 days, whichever first occurs. A public body shall not assess a fee for the time spent in its review.

#### SECTION 23. [COMPLAINTS, REMEDIES]

law.

(a) Subject to appropriation, the attorney general shall interpret and enforce the open meeting

(b) At least 30 days prior to the filing of a complaint with the attorney general, the complainant shall file a written complaint with the public body, setting forth the circumstances which constitute the alleged violation and giving the body an opportunity to remedy the alleged violation; provided, however, that such complaint shall be filed within 30 days of the date of the alleged violation. The public body shall, within 14 business days of receipt of a complaint, send a copy of the complaint to the attorney general and notify the attorney general of any remedial action taken. Any remedial action taken by the public body in response to a complaint under this subsection shall not be admissible as evidence against the public body that a violation occurred in any later administrative or judicial proceeding relating to such alleged violation. The attorney general may authorize an extension of time to the public body for the purpose of taking remedial action upon the written request of the public body and a showing of good cause to grant the extension.

(c) Upon the receipt of a complaint by any person, the attorney general shall determine, in a timely manner, whether there has been a violation of the open meeting law. The attorney general may, and before imposing any civil penalty on a public body shall, hold a hearing on any such complaint. Following a determination that a violation has occurred, the attorney general shall determine whether the public body, 1 or more of the members, or both, are responsible and whether the violation was intentional or unintentional. Upon the finding of a violation, the attorney general may issue an order to:

(1) compel immediate and future compliance with the open meeting law;

(2) compel attendance at a training session authorized by the attorney general;

(3) nullify in whole or in part any action taken at the meeting;

(4) impose a civil penalty upon the public body of not more than \$1,000 for each intentional violation;

(5) reinstate an employee without loss of compensation, seniority, tenure or other benefits;

(6) compel that minutes, records or other materials be made public; or

(7) prescribe other appropriate action.

(d) A public body or any member of a body aggrieved by any order issued pursuant to this section may, notwithstanding any general or special law to the contrary, obtain judicial review of the order only through an action in superior court seeking relief in the nature of certiorari; provided, however, that notwithstanding section 4 of chapter 249, any such action shall be commenced in superior court within 21 days of receipt of the order. Any order issued under this section shall be stayed pending judicial review; provided, however, that if the order nullifies an action of the public body, the body shall not implement such action pending judicial review.

(e) If any public body or member thereof shall fail to comply with the requirements set forth in any order issued by the attorney general, or shall fail to pay any civil penalty imposed within 21 days of the date of issuance of such order or within 30 days following the decision of the superior court if judicial review of such order has been timely sought, the attorney general may file an action to compel compliance. Such action shall be filed in Suffolk superior court with respect to state public bodies and, with respect to all other public bodies, in the superior court in any county in which the public body acts or meets. If such body or member has not timely sought judicial review of the order, such order shall not be open to review in an action to compel compliance.

(f) As an alternative to the procedure in subsection (b), the attorney general or 3 or more registered voters may initiate a civil action to enforce the open meeting law.

Any action under this subsection shall be filed in Suffolk superior court with respect to state public bodies and, with respect to all other public bodies, in the superior court in any county in which the public body acts or meets.

In any action filed pursuant to this subsection, in addition to all other remedies available to the superior court, in law or in equity, the court shall have all of the remedies set forth in subsection (b).

In any action filed under this subsection, the order of notice on the complaint shall be returnable not later than 10 days after the filing and the complaint shall be heard and determined on the return day or on such day as the court shall fix, having regard to the speediest possible determination of the cause consistent with the rights of the parties; provided, however, that orders may be issued at any time on or after the filing of the complaint without notice when such order is necessary to fulfill the purposes of the open meeting law. In the hearing of any action under this subsection, the burden shall be on the respondent to show by a preponderance of the evidence that the action complained of in such complaint was in accordance with and authorized by the open meeting law; provided, however, that no civil penalty may be imposed on an individual absent proof that the action complained of violated the open meeting law.

(g) It shall be a defense to the imposition of a penalty that the public body, after full disclosure, acted in good faith compliance with the advice of the public body's legal counsel.

(h) Payment of civil penalties under this section paid to or received by the attorney general shall be paid into the general fund of the commonwealth.

#### SECTION 24. [INVESTIGATIONS, HEARINGS]

(a) Whenever the attorney general has reasonable cause to believe that a person, including any public body and any other state, regional, county, municipal or other governmental official or entity, has violated the open meeting law, the attorney general may conduct an investigation to ascertain whether in fact such person has violated the open meeting law. Upon notification of an investigation, any person, public body or any other state, regional, county, municipal or other governmental official or entity who is the subject of an investigation, shall make all information necessary to conduct such investigation available to the attorney general. In the event that the person, public body or any other state, regional, county, municipal or other governmental official or entity being investigated does not voluntarily provide relevant information to the attorney general within 30 days of receiving notice of the investigation, the attorney general may: (1) take testimony under oath concerning such alleged violation of the open meeting law; (2) examine or cause to be examined any documentary material of whatever nature relevant to such alleged violation of the open meeting law; and (3) require attendance during such examination of documentary material of any person having knowledge of the documentary material and take testimony under oath or acknowledgment in respect of any such documentary material. Such testimony and examination shall take place in the county where such person resides or has a place of business or, if the parties consent or such person is a nonresident or has no place of business within the commonwealth, in Suffolk county.

(b) Notice of the time, place and cause of such taking of testimony, examination or attendance shall be given by the attorney general at least 10 days prior to the date of such taking of testimony or examination.

(c) Service of any such notice may be made by: (1) delivering a duly-executed copy to the person to be served or to a partner or to any officer or agent authorized by appointment or by law to receive service of process on behalf of such person; (2) delivering a duly-executed copy to the principal place of business in the commonwealth of the person to be served; or (3) mailing by registered or certified mail a duly-executed copy addressed to the person to be served at the principal place of business in the commonwealth or, if said person has no place of business in the commonwealth, to his principal office or place of business.

(d) Each such notice shall: (1) state the time and place for the taking of testimony or the examination and the name and address of each person to be examined, if known and, if the name is not known, a general description sufficient to identify him or the particular class or group to which he belongs; (2) state the statute and section thereof, the alleged violation of which is under investigation and the general subject matter of the investigation; (3) describe the class or classes of documentary material to be produced thereunder with reasonable specificity, so as fairly to indicate the material demanded; (4) prescribe a return date within which the documentary material is to be produced; and (5) identify the members of the attorney general's staff to whom such documentary material is to be made available for inspection and copying.

(e) No such notice shall contain any requirement which would be unreasonable or improper if contained in a subpoena duces tecum issued by a court of the commonwealth or require the disclosure of any documentary material which would be privileged, or which for any other reason would not be required by a subpoena duces tecum issued by a court of the commonwealth.

(f) Any documentary material or other information produced by any person pursuant to this section shall not, unless otherwise ordered by a court of the commonwealth for good cause shown, be disclosed to any person other than the authorized agent or representative of the attorney general, unless with the consent of the person producing the same; provided, however, that such material or information may be disclosed by the attorney general in court pleadings or other papers filed in court.

(g) At any time prior to the date specified in the notice, or within 21 days after the notice has been served, whichever period is shorter, the court may, upon motion for good cause shown, extend such reporting date or modify or set aside such demand or grant a protective order in accordance with the standards set forth in Rule 26(c) of the Massachusetts Rules of Civil Procedure. The motion may be filed in the superior court of the county in which the person served resides or has his usual place of business or in Suffolk county. This section shall not be applicable to any criminal proceeding nor shall information obtained under the authority of this section be admissible in evidence in any criminal prosecution for substantially identical transactions.

#### SECTION 25. [REGULATIONS AND ADVISORY OPINIONS]

(a) The attorney general shall have the authority to promulgate rules and regulations to carry out enforcement of the open meeting law.

(b) The attorney general shall have the authority to interpret the open meeting law and to issue written letter rulings or advisory opinions according to rules established under this section.

#### CERTIFICATE OF RECEIPT OF OPEN MEETING LAW MATERIALS

l,		, who qualified for the office of	
	(Name)		
		, on	, certify pursuant
	(Office)	(Date)	

to G.L. c. 30A, § 20(g), that I have received copies of the following Open Meeting Law

materials:

- 1) the Open Meeting Law, G.L. c. 30A, §§ 18-25;
- 2) regulations promulgated by the Attorney General under G.L. c. 30A, § 25; and
- educational materials promulgated by the Attorney General under G.L. c. 30A, § 19(b), explaining the Open Meeting Law and its application.

I have read and understand the requirements of the Open Meeting Law and the

consequences for violating it. I further understand that the materials I have received may be

revised or updated from time to time, and that I have a continuing obligation to implement any

changes in the Open Meeting Law during my term of office.

(Name)

(Name of Public Body)

(Date)

Pursuant to G.L. c. 30A, § 20(g), an executed copy of this certificate shall be retained, according to the relevant records retention schedule, by the appointing authority, city or town clerk, or the executive director or other appropriate administrator of a state or regional body, or their designee.